



COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Strasbourg, 8 November 2019

MIN-LANG (2019) 17final

EUROPEAN CHARTER FOR REGIONAL OR MINORITY LANGUAGES

**Report of the Committee of Experts
presented to the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe
in accordance with Article 16 of the Charter**

Fifth Report

SLOVENIA

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages provides for a control mechanism to evaluate how the Charter is applied in a State Party with a view to, where necessary, making recommendations for improving its legislation, policy and practices. The central element of this procedure is the Committee of Experts, set up under Article 17 of the Charter. Its principal purpose is to report to the Committee of Ministers on its evaluation of compliance by a Party with its undertakings, to examine the real situation of regional or minority languages in the State and, where appropriate, to encourage the Party to gradually reach a higher level of commitment.

To facilitate this task, the Committee of Ministers adopted, in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 1, an outline for periodical reports that a Party is required to submit to the Secretary General. This outline requires the State to give an account of the concrete application of the Charter, the general policy for the languages protected under Part II and, in more precise terms, all measures that have been taken in application of the provisions chosen for each language protected under Part III of the Charter. The Committee of Experts' first task is therefore to examine the information contained in the periodical report for all the relevant regional or minority languages on the territory of the State concerned. The periodical report shall be made public by the State in accordance with Article 15, paragraph 2.

The Committee of Experts' role is to evaluate the existing legal acts, regulations and real practice applied in each State for its regional or minority languages. It has established its working methods accordingly. The Committee of Experts gathers information from the respective authorities and from independent sources within the State, in order to obtain a fair and just overview of the real language situation. After a preliminary examination of a periodical report, the Committee of Experts submits, if necessary, a number of questions to each Party to obtain supplementary information from the authorities on matters it considers insufficiently developed in the report itself. This written procedure is usually followed up by an on-the-spot visit by a delegation of the Committee of Experts to the State in question. During this visit the delegation meets bodies and associations whose work is closely related to the use of the relevant languages, and consults the authorities on matters that have been brought to its attention. This information-gathering process is designed to enable the Committee of Experts to evaluate more effectively the application of the Charter in the State concerned.

Having concluded this process, the Committee of Experts adopts its own report. Once adopted by the Committee of Experts, this evaluation report is submitted to the authorities of the respective State Party for possible comments within a given deadline. A confidential dialogue may, at this stage, be requested by this State Party. The final evaluation report is made public, together with the comments, if any, which the authorities of the State Party may have made. This document is then transmitted to the Committee of Ministers for the adoption of its recommendations to the State Party, on the basis of the proposals for recommendations contained in the evaluation report.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	4
Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Slovenia – Recent developments and trends	5
1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Slovenia	5
1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Slovenia	12
Chapter 2 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations.....	16
2.1 Croatian.....	16
2.1.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Croatian	16
2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Croatian in Slovenia.....	17
2.2 German.....	18
2.2.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German.....	18
2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Slovenia	19
2.3 Hungarian	20
2.3.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian	20
2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Slovenia.....	24
2.4 Italian.....	25
2.4.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Italian	25
2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Italian in Slovenia.....	29
2.5 Romani	30
2.5.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani	30
2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Slovenia	31
2.6 Serbian	32
2.6.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Serbian	32
2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Serbian in Slovenia	33
Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe.....	34
Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification.....	35
Appendix II: Comments from the Slovenian authorities	37

Executive Summary

The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages entered into force in Slovenia in 2001 and applies to the following languages: Croatian, German, Italian, Hungarian, Romani and Serbian.

Hungarian and Italian benefit from a high level of legal protection, as co-official languages in the areas defined as “ethnically mixed”. Knowledge of Hungarian or Italian may be required for certain positions in the administration and an allowance is awarded to civil servants using these languages. Language courses for civil servants and legal terminology workshops for judges, prosecutors and court staff are organised. During recent years, measures have been taken to ensure the translation of an increased number of administrative forms in Hungarian or Italian. Cross-border programmes with Hungary and Italy aimed at strengthening the provision of education were implemented. Furthermore, the same aim was pursued with the legal amendments in the field of education, adopted in 2018.

Certain shortcomings remain, however, with respect to the use of these languages in practice. The language competence of teachers and their ability to use Hungarian and Italian as a medium of instruction still needs to be reinforced. A more pro-active approach from the authorities is needed for the use of Hungarian and Italian in administration, including encouraging their speakers to make use of the available opportunities. Concerns have been expressed regarding the financial resources available for the Hungarian and Italian programmes of the public broadcaster.

There are plans to start pilot teaching of Romani as a subject as of 2020. Romani is used to some extent in the media. The situation of Romani and of its speakers differs, however, greatly across regions of Slovenia.

The Slovenian legal framework still makes no provision for the recognition of Croatian, German and Serbian as regional or minority languages, which are covered by Part II of the Charter.

There is an obvious need to raise awareness in Slovenian society about the regional or minority languages, their history and cultures as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia.

This fifth evaluation report by the Committee of Experts is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to Slovenia in September 2019.

Chapter 1 The situation of the regional or minority languages in Slovenia – Recent developments and trends

1. The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages (hereafter referred to as “the Charter”) is a treaty of the Council of Europe putting obligations on its States Parties to protect and promote the country’s traditional minority languages in all fields of public life: education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, and transfrontier exchanges. Slovenia signed the Charter on 3 July 1997 and ratified it on 4 October 2000. The Charter entered into force in Slovenia on 1 January 2001. It applies to the following languages: Croatian, German, Hungarian, Italian, Romani and Serbian. Croatian, German and Serbian are covered by Part II (Article 7), Romani is covered by Part II as a non-territorial language, whereas Hungarian and Italian receive protection under both Part II and Part III (Articles 8-14).

2. Article 15.1 of the Charter requires States Parties to submit three-yearly reports about the implementation of the Charter.¹ The Slovenian authorities submitted their fifth periodical report on 8 April 2019, five years and seven months after the previous periodical report (2013). This fifth evaluation report is based on the information contained in the periodical report, additional information received from the authorities, statements made by representatives of the speakers of the minority languages during the on-the-spot visit (17-20 September 2019) and/or submitted in written form pursuant to Article 16. 2 of the Charter.

3. Chapter 1 of this evaluation report focuses on the general developments and trends regarding the regional or minority languages in Slovenia and the situation of these languages. It examines in particular the measures taken by the Slovenian authorities to respond to the recommendations made by the Committee of Experts and the Committee of Ministers at the end of the fourth monitoring cycle and also highlights new issues. Chapter 2 provides a detailed overview of the state of implementation of each of Slovenia’s undertakings in respect of the given language as well as the recommendations addressed to the Slovenian authorities. On the basis of its evaluation, the Committee of Experts proposes, in Chapter 3, recommendations to the Committee of Ministers to be addressed to the Government of Slovenia, as provided in Article 16.4 of the Charter.

4. As far as the detailed legal examination of each undertaking is concerned, the Committee of Experts refers to its **fourth evaluation report on the application of the Charter in Slovenia (ECRML (2014) 5²)**.

5. This report is based on the political and legal situation prevailing at the time of the Committee of Experts’ on-the-spot visit to Slovenia in September 2019. This evaluation report was adopted by the Committee of Experts on 8 November 2019. It was made public on 3 July 2020.

1.1 General developments in policies, legislation and practice concerning the regional or minority languages in Slovenia

6. Slovenia continues to provide a high legal standard of protection for the Hungarian and Italian languages in the areas where the Hungarian and Italian national communities live (“ethnically mixed areas”), including through constitutional provisions, and shows commitment to their protection and promotion. In recent years, steps have been taken to improve the implementation of the legal framework, although shortcomings in the use of Hungarian and Italian languages in practice still remain. The legal framework, policies and practice, however, continue to show a different approach to the “autochthonous Hungarian and Italian national communities”, to the “Roma community” and to the other ethnic groups, which is reflected in the protection and promotion of their respective languages.

¹ Since 1 July 2019, new rules apply according to the Committee of Ministers Decisions adopted on 28 November 2018 on the strengthening the monitoring mechanism of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, whereby States Parties submit their periodical report every five years (instead of every three years) and information about the implementation of the recommendations identified by the Committee of Experts in its evaluation report as being for immediate action every two and a half years.

² <https://rm.coe.int/CoERMPublicCommonSearchServices/DisplayDCTMContent?documentId=09000016806dba62>

7. The National Programme for Language Policy 2014-2018 was implemented and included, *inter alia*, measures addressing the “languages of autochthonous national communities, the Roma community, other minority ethnic groups and immigrants”. Subsequent Action Plans for Language Education and for Language Infrastructure were adopted in 2015. An Inter-Ministerial Working Group, set up in 2014, monitored the implementation of the language policy and prepared annual reports, which were considered by the National Assembly Commission for National Communities. In addition, for Hungarian and Italian, a Programme of Measures for the Implementation on the Regulations on Bilingualism for 2015-2018 was established. Annual reports on its implementation were adopted by the government, which had the obligation to inform the National Assembly Commission for National Communities. Furthermore, in April 2019, this Commission proposed to the government to draw up, in co-operation with the representatives of the Hungarian and Italian national communities, a list of measures addressing current and outstanding issues relating to their situation and the implementation of their rights.

8. The Committee of Experts notes that some measures foreseen in the aforementioned documents also respond to issues raised in its previous evaluation report with respect to Hungarian or Italian. Moreover, such policy/strategy documents, when dedicated to regional or minority languages, indicate a structured approach and can contribute to a better implementation of the Charter. The participation of the representatives of the regional or minority language speakers in the design, implementation and monitoring of these policy/strategy documents is fundamental to their success.

9. The Committee of Experts also underlines that the protection and promotion of regional or minority languages, which are in a weaker position and whose speakers often want to avoid being seen as “trouble makers” requires a pro-active approach from the authorities, as well as special measures responding to the needs of these languages. This is particularly the case for languages with a low number of speakers.

Application of the Charter to Croatian, German and Serbian

10. In the previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts noted that the Croatian, German and Serbian languages have been used in the present territory of Slovenia for centuries. As traditional minority languages, Croatian, German and Serbian are protected by Part II of the Charter in the areas where they have been traditionally used in Slovenia pursuant to Article 2.1, which provides that “each Party undertakes to apply the provisions of Part II to all the regional or minority languages spoken within its territory and which comply with the definition of Article 1”. The application of Part II to these languages has been addressed by the Committee of Experts since the first monitoring cycle and is also confirmed by the Committee of Ministers. However, the Slovenian authorities have not legally recognised Croatian, German and Serbian as traditional minority languages, nor have they implemented Part II for these languages. Therefore, in its last recommendations, the Committee of Ministers recommended that the Slovenian authorities “**recognise German, Croatian and Serbian as minority languages traditionally spoken in Slovenia and apply the provisions of Part II to these languages, in co-operation with the speakers**”³.

11. During the period under review, however, this recommendation was not implemented. The Slovenian authorities still do not clearly recognise the traditional character of Croatian, German and Serbian and the application of Part II to them, but rather refer to them as “languages of migrants”. The level of protection and promotion of these languages is generally below the requirements of the Charter. Against this background, it needs to be underlined that the Charter requires its States Parties to recognise regional or minority languages as an expression of cultural wealth (Article 7.1.a) and stresses the need for resolute action to promote them (Article 7.1.c). As the Committee of Experts has pointed out on several occasions concerning Slovenia and other States Parties, Article 7.1.a aims at an explicit recognition of the given language in the domestic legal order.⁴ “Resolute action” (Article 7.1.c) also requires a legal framework for the promotion of regional or minority languages in public life as well as the establishment of bodies

³ CM/RecChL(2014)4

⁴ See, for example, 4th Report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML(2014)5, para. 36; 1st Report of the Committee of Experts on Croatia, ECRML(2001)2, para. 30; 7th Report of the Committee of Experts on Switzerland, MIN-LANG(2019)10, para. 20.

responsible for such promotion, in co-operation with the speakers, and the provision of adequate financial resources.⁵ In Slovenia, the lack of recognition of Croatian, Serbian and German as traditionally used regional or minority languages is the basic obstacle to the implementation of the Part II provisions concerning these languages. This is the case, for example, of Article 7.1.f, which requires “appropriate forms and means for the teaching and study of regional or minority languages” and implies, *inter alia*, the development of a specific educational model covering all levels of education and which takes the traditional character of the given language into account, including by covering the local culture which is reflected by the language. Croatian, Serbian and German do not currently benefit from such measures.

12. The Charter also requires the consultation of the minority language speakers (Article 7.4). In 2015 and 2018, representatives of the speakers of German, Serbian and Croatian⁶ jointly submitted proposals for measures implementing the Charter concerning their languages to the Slovenian government and, *inter alia*, to the Council of Europe. On both occasions, the speakers asked to begin dialogue on the implementation of the Committee of Experts’ and the Committee of Ministers’ recommendations and to be consulted in the preparation of Slovenia’s periodical report. Regrettably, the Slovenian authorities have so far not carried out such consultations. The Committee of Experts urges the Slovenian authorities to take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by these groups and to consult them on the implementation of the Charter concerning Croatian, German and Serbian as soon as possible.

Respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to regional or minority languages

13. The way a regional or minority language is protected and promoted is also linked to its perception by majority language speakers. Therefore, awareness raising among the majority is of the utmost importance and requires constant efforts in both the educational and the media domains. The fundamental goal is for the majority population to value the fact that regional or minority language speakers form part of the linguistic and cultural heritage of the state with their different languages and cultures.⁷ In this sense, Article 7.3 is a key provision of the Charter and education and media are the main means of promoting “respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to regional or minority languages”.

14. According to the periodical report and additional information received from the authorities, the objectives of education as defined in Article 2 of the Elementary School Act contain a vague reference to “responsible attitude towards [...] one’s own and other people’s cultures.” More detailed objectives are contained in the syllabi for social studies (pupils should be acquainted with the diversity of the Slovenian population, namely national minorities and immigrants; they should be able to indicate the areas where national minorities live and are introduced to notions such a national minority or bilingual school) and geography (pupils should explain the reasons behind bilingualism and the importance of protecting national minorities). However, the way these objectives are implemented depends on the school teachers. The compulsory elective subject *Romani culture* teaches about Romani culture and history, while *Ethnology - cultural heritage and lifestyles*, another elective subject, is expected to acquaint pupils with various cultural forms.

15. As far as media are concerned, according to the periodical report, Radiotelevizija Slovenija (RTV Slovenija) is obliged to support the dissemination of knowledge of other cultures present in Slovenia. In addition, there are radio and television programmes in Hungarian and Italian. The Committee of Experts underlines that the objectives of Article 7.3 mainly refer to awareness raising in the mainstream media throughout the country and thus cannot be achieved by programmes in minority languages only. As far as the Croatian and Serbian speakers are concerned, according to the periodical report, a new radio programme “for minorities from the former Yugoslav republics” has been broadcast since 2016 by Radio Slovenija, featuring contributions “in Slovenian or in translation” (*Sami naši*, 30 minutes/week, Sundays from 9.30-10 p.m.). A television programme *Na Glas!*, which also “targets ethnic communities from the former Yugoslavia” and “covers the life of members of the first, second and third generations of immigrants”

⁵ See, for example, 2nd Report of the Committee of Experts on Germany, ECRML(2006)1, para. 24; 2nd Report of the Committee of Experts on Sweden, ECRML(2006)4, paragraph 28.

⁶ Representatives of the speakers of Croatian only in 2018.

⁷ See, for example, 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovakia, ECRML (2016) 2, paragraph 69.

is broadcast by the national television channel. These programmes, however, hardly aim to present Croatian and Serbian as an integral part of the linguistic and cultural heritage of Slovenia and to cover the Croatian or Serbian speakers living in the area where the language has been traditionally spoken. The periodical report further mentions the internationally co-produced programme *Alps – Danube – Adriatic, images from central Europe*, which it also defines as “programmes for foreign audiences”. It covers a variety of topics from several countries in the region and it is not clear whether the German minority in Slovenia has ever been presented in this programme.

16. Cultural diversity and intercultural relations are also addressed in various projects, some of them carried out, for example, by the Italian national community.

17. The regional or minority language speakers, however, underline that adequate information about their history and culture is not provided in education.⁸ Reporting about regional or minority language speakers is also either largely absent from mainstream media or they are rather referred to in negative contexts. Negative attitudes with regard to speakers of regional or minority languages seem to be widespread, whereas stigmatisation and stereotypes affect in particular the German and Italian speakers. The lack of awareness about the history and culture reflected by the Hungarian and Italian languages is especially visible outside the areas where the respective national communities live. Italian speakers also draw attention to a tendency to appropriate their cultural heritage and to define it as Slovenian.

18. As in the previous evaluation reports, the Committee of Experts reiterates that more resolute steps are needed to promote awareness and tolerance about the regional or minority languages in Slovenia.⁹ The authorities should raise the awareness of the general public in mainstream education, notably in the curricula, teaching materials and teacher training, regarding the traditional presence of the Croatian, German, Hungarian, Italian, Romani and Serbian languages and their contribution to Slovenian society. Media should be encouraged, without prejudice to their independence, to pay more attention to these languages and cultures as integral parts of Slovenia’s history and culture. In addition, awareness of regional or minority languages should be raised as a component and as an expected result of mainstream journalist training, as well as of teacher training.

Relations between linguistic groups (Article 7.1.e)

19. According to the periodical report, one of the criteria for public calls for tenders for cultural and other projects is co-operation between various communities. Such projects are generally submitted by NGOs that do not necessarily represent regional or minority language speakers and do not address them in particular. The Committee of Experts underlines that relations between the linguistic groups in Slovenia should be also promoted beyond the framework of projects and among all groups whose languages are covered by the Charter.

Use of the regional or minority languages in education

20. The use of the regional or minority languages in this field and the measures taken vary significantly. Bilingual Slovenian – Hungarian education and education in Italian are available. Romani is not yet taught as a separate subject. There is no model for teaching Croatian, German or Serbian as regional or minority languages.

21. In 2018, amendments to the Act Guaranteeing Special Rights to Members of the Italian and Hungarian National Communities in the field of Education were adopted. They foresee, *inter alia*, the possibility for Hungarian and Italian speakers to enrol children in bilingual schools teaching in Slovenian and Hungarian, or in schools teaching in Italian, even if they live outside the “ethnically mixed areas”. Other articles foresee the provision of bilingual syllabi, catalogues of knowledge standards and exam catalogues

⁸ See also Fourth Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, ACFC/OP/IV(2017)003, paragraph 78.

⁹ See 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 99, 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2010) 5, paragraph 77.

in the bilingual areas; amended conditions regarding the proficiency in Hungarian or Italian and on the teacher certification examination; the possibility for the national community to provide opinions on the annual work plans of schools, as well as the setting-up of an expert group within the National Education Institute in order to provide advice and professional support. The information received during the on-the-spot visit indicates that the law is not yet fully implemented.

22. Teacher training is provided in Slovenia, but future teachers may also study in Hungary or Italy. Adequate teacher training, including in Hungarian and Italian and for teaching subjects in these languages, as well as a high level of language competence are essential for the provision of minority language education. According to the periodical report and the information received from the regional or minority languages speakers, there is still a need to enhance the language competence of teaching staff in these minority languages. The authorities are aware of the importance of teacher training and language competence, as well as the need to modernise training programmes, including methodology for schools teaching in Slovenian and Hungarian. Two cross-border programmes (*Increasing the quality of national education for the Hungarian national community living in Slovenia and the Slovenian national community living in Hungary* and *Increasing the quality of national education for the Italian national community living in Slovenia and the Slovenian national community living in Italy*) were carried out in recent years addressing, in particular, teacher training and were appreciated by the Hungarian and Italian speakers.

23. As far as monitoring is concerned, Article 8.1.i requires evaluating and analysing the specific measures taken and the progress achieved with regard to minority language education. Reports should be drafted and made public, containing, among other things, information on the extent and availability of minority language education, developments in language proficiency, teacher supply and the provision of teaching materials. The purpose of such monitoring is to identify satisfactory measures and methods, as well as the areas where additional efforts are needed. Regular reports provide the opportunity to assess minority language education over time, thereby making it possible to adjust methods and measures according to the experiences acquired through the reports. It is unclear whether such monitoring currently takes place.¹⁰

Use of the regional or minority languages by judicial authorities

24. The Constitution of Slovenia (Article 11) declares Italian and Hungarian official languages, along with Slovenian, in the areas of the municipalities where the Italian or Hungarian national communities live (“ethnically mixed areas”). The legislation further provides for their use by judicial authorities. The Courts Act (Article 5), for example, foresees that in the areas where the Hungarian and Italian national communities live, courts shall operate in Hungarian or Italian if a party who lives in that area uses one of these languages. According to the Court Rules (Art.62), “if only one party is involved in the proceedings or if both parties use the same language, the entire procedure shall be in the language of these parties”. Where one of the two parties uses Slovenian and the other Hungarian or Italian, the procedure shall be run in Slovenian and Italian or Hungarian, in the so-called bilingual procedure.

25. Some courts and prosecutor’s offices employ judges and prosecutors who speak Hungarian or Italian, or have posts foreseen to this effect. In 2018, two workshops on legal terminology for Hungarian and two for Italian were organised. Forms have also been translated. Nevertheless, as the authorities also indicate, Hungarian and Italian are rarely used, in practice, before courts. Since interpretation is needed in most cases, thus increasing the duration of the trial, Hungarian and Italian speakers tend to use Slovenian, in order to expedite the proceedings. The Slovenian authorities should continue to take measures that aim to improve the Hungarian and Italian language competence of judges, prosecutors and court staff in order to facilitate the use of these languages in practice.

¹⁰ See for example 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Germany, ECRML (2011)2, paragraph 72, 6th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Germany, CM(2018) 142, paragraph 15.

Use of the regional or minority languages by administrative authorities

26. The above-mentioned constitutional provision on the co-official status of Hungarian and Italian in the areas of the municipalities where the respective national communities live (“ethnically mixed areas” as defined by the respective municipal statutes) and further legislation provide a strong legal basis for the use of Hungarian and Italian by administrative authorities. Several measures are in place to facilitate such use. Elementary or advanced knowledge of these languages may be required for certain positions in administration and civil servants are entitled to an allowance for bilingualism (bilingualism bonus). Funding is also provided from the state budget to municipalities where Hungarian and Italian are used (0.15% of the total expenditure of the municipalities). Language courses for civil servants are organised, including, for example, since 2014, for the police. Some authorities also employ translators.

27. In recent years, the Ministry of Public Administration organised consultations with the relevant municipalities and prepared written information about the provisions governing the use of Hungarian and Italian. In addition, administrative forms in Hungarian and Italian have been translated and made available on the official portal www.e-uprava.gov.si. The Committee of Experts notes that some institutions, such as the Pension and Invalidity Insurance Institute, provide bilingual forms in Slovenian and Italian. Some of the regional or minority language speakers whom the Committee of Experts met would prefer bilingual (rather than monolingual Italian or Hungarian) forms, as they would be directly available, whereas now they often have to ask for the form in a regional or minority language in administrative offices. Websites of different authorities increasingly provide versions or information in Hungarian and Italian. Documents such as identity cards and driving licences are issued bilingually. In 2016, authorities such as the Employment Service defined positions for which knowledge of Hungarian or Italian is necessary at its relevant local branches and since then offer the possibility to receive a bilingualism bonus. Similarly, in 2016, the Social Work Centre in Lendava/Lendva also defined knowledge of Hungarian as a condition for occupying several positions.

28. Nevertheless, despite these commendable measures and a certain use of Hungarian and Italian by the administrative authorities, shortcomings remain at practical level. Although language courses are organised, they do not always seem to ensure a sufficient level of Hungarian or Italian to allow the use of these languages on a daily basis in a professional environment. Moreover, the authorities are generally prepared to use Hungarian or Italian with people who approach them in these languages or to provide documents in Hungarian or Italian upon request. However, there is a need to encourage regional or minority language speakers to make use of the existing opportunities and to use Hungarian or Italian. Regional or minority language speakers are often hesitant to make use of the language facilities that the authorities provide in administration, since they speak the official language and do not want to be regarded as “trouble-makers”. Therefore, in addition to organisational measures, pro-active steps should be taken in order to encourage minority language speakers to use their language.¹¹

29. As far as public services are concerned, the Committee of Experts would like to underline that, in the sense of Article 10. 3, this applies to services provided by the administrative authorities or private enterprises acting on their behalf (e.g. railway, urban transport, electricity, water and gas, cleaning and sanitation, telephone services, refuse collection and disposal, sports facilities, entertainment venues). Hungarian and Italian are used only to some extent in the provision of these services, especially by enterprises functioning at municipal level. There have been cases where the regional or minority language speakers or other institutions asked such public service enterprises to also use Hungarian or Italian and the reaction was positive. However, there should be a more pro-active approach in this respect, in order to *ensure* the use of these languages as required by the ratification.

30. Discussions are currently taking place in Slovenia about establishing regions/provinces and at the time of the on-the-spot visit a public consultation process was ongoing. The Italian speakers, in particular, are concerned about the consequences, *inter alia*, of the inclusion of the area where they live in “Littoral and Carniola Province” for the use of Italian. This would cover an extended territory, where the Italian speakers would represent a low share of the population and where several authorities would be situated outside the

¹¹ See, for example, 1st report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Romania, ECRML (2012) 3, paragraph 435.

area where the Italian national community lives. The Committee of Experts would like to remind the authorities that Article 7.1.b requires them to “ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of regional or minority languages”. Moreover, the provisions of Article 10.2.a, b, c and e also have to be implemented for regional authorities.

Use of the regional or minority languages in media

31. RTV Slovenija broadcasts programmes in Hungarian, Italian and Romani. However, the occasional use in some broadcasts of Croatian, German and Serbian (see below) cannot be considered as provision of media programmes in regional or minority languages.

32. As for many other public broadcasters, in recent years RTV Slovenija has been facing financial problems and discussions have been ongoing about its restructuring and future development. In this context, the Hungarian and Italian speakers are very concerned about the future of the programmes in these languages.

33. Two programme committees are in place for the Hungarian and Italian radio and television programmes. The Hungarian and Italian speakers are represented on these committees. They also have one person each representing them on the RTV Slovenija Programme Board. However, it seems that their views in the Programme Board are rarely taken into account.

Use of the regional or minority languages in cultural activities and facilities

34. Support is given to cultural activities, however, this varies greatly among languages. As far as Part II languages are concerned, the Committee of Experts notes that in many cases the amounts are insufficient to carry out adequate cultural activities.

Use of the regional or minority languages in economic and social life

35. Hungarian and Italian are, to some extent, used in economic and social life as there are also legal obligations to this effect applying to companies. Social care facilities such as retirement homes use Hungarian or Italian. However, this use is more problematic for hospitals. According to the periodical report, the legislation does not foresee an obligation to use regional or minority languages in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents, but does not prevent it either. Nevertheless, no such documents seem to be drafted in Hungarian or Italian. Safety instructions, such as evacuation instructions, safety rules, warnings, are also generally only drafted in Slovenian. Information on the rights of consumers, for example, on the rules on product warranties, on the manufacturer’s liability, on the right to withdraw from a contract, also do not seem to be available in Hungarian or Italian.

36. The Committee of Experts has not received information on how the use of Hungarian or Italian in economic and social life is facilitated and/or encouraged in conformity with Article 13.1.d. Relevant measures could consist of facilitating the use of regional or minority languages in the tourism sector or during international fairs, giving rewards to companies that are using the regional or minority language or initiating a bilingualism campaign. The same applies to 13.2.b, which requires the organisation of activities promoting these languages in economic and social life in the public sector.

Use of the regional or minority languages in transfrontier exchanges

37. Transfrontier exchanges play an important role in promoting regional or minority languages and numerous activities are carried out. In some cases, they depend on the initiative of non-governmental organisations rather than on the authorities.

1.2 The situation of the individual regional or minority languages in Slovenia

38. The Committee of Experts noted in the previous monitoring cycles that the **Croatian** language has a traditional presence in Bela Krajina and Žumberak (Dolenjska region).¹² Croatian is, however, regarded as one of the “languages of the nations of the former Yugoslav republics” and it is in this context that measures which benefit Croatian are taken. According to the periodical report, between 2013-2017 annual sums varying between approximately €17 000 and €26 000 were provided by the Slovenian authorities to co-finance 25 to 37 projects. These comprise various cultural activities, not only dedicated to the promotion of the language, and cover Slovenia as a whole, not necessarily just the area where the language has been traditionally spoken. While acknowledging the importance of financial support to Croatian cultural activities in Slovenia, such limited support, amounting to a few hundred euros per project in some cases, is clearly insufficient for an adequate protection and promotion of Croatian. Moreover, the Committee of Experts reiterates¹³ that earmarked permanent funding in order to ensure the running of minority institutions in the long run is also necessary. Croatian is only occasionally used on radio and television programmes, mainly in interviews in the framework of the programmes *Sami naši* and *Na Glas!* (see under 1.1 above). This does not amount to a sufficient broadcasting duration in Croatian and issues relevant for the Croatian speakers living in the area where the language has been traditionally spoken are rarely addressed. Among the projects financed and mentioned above, some radio programmes in Croatian are listed, which received between €500 and €1000 per year in 2014-2016, an amount that is too insufficient to be considered as “facilitating/encouraging” the use of Croatian in the media. There is no educational model for Croatian as a regional or minority language in the areas where this language is traditionally used. According to the periodical report, Croatian can be taught as a foreign language or as a “mother tongue of children of other nationalities”, models which do not meet the requirements of the Charter for teaching regional or minority languages. It seems that not even these models are available in the area where the language has been traditionally spoken. Croatian may be studied at university level, but according to the periodical report, no research on Croatian has been funded by the Slovenian Research Agency in recent years. A Government Council for the Issues of the National Communities of the Peoples of the Former Socialist Republic of Yugoslavia is in place, however, it does not appear to be an adequate framework for consultation on issues concerning Croatian as a regional or minority language.

39. As noted in all previous monitoring cycles, **German** has been traditionally spoken in Slovenia and most speakers live nowadays in places such as Maribor, Apače, Celje and in the eastern Kočevje area.¹⁴ According to the periodical report, between 2013-2017 annual sums varying between approximately €20 000 and €26 000 were provided by the Slovenian authorities to co-finance 14 to 25 projects. Some of these, however, do not deal with the promotion of German as a regional or minority language. Moreover, as in the case of other languages, the amounts for individual projects are in many cases very low, sometimes only several hundred euros. While acknowledging the importance of financial support to German cultural activities in Slovenia, such limited support is clearly insufficient for the protection and promotion of German. Earmarked permanent funding in order to ensure the running of minority institutions in the long run is also necessary. German is almost absent from public life, including media. The periodical report refers to “radio and television programmes for the foreign public” and, in this context, to news in German and English broadcast by Radio Slovenija International, an online radio. Such a model, which equally applies to English, has clearly not been designed and is insufficient for German as a minority language. German can only be heard sometimes in the programme *Alps – Danube – Adriatic, images from central Europe*, when interviews with German speakers outside Slovenia are broadcast. The programme also deals with topics which are too broad to be relevant for the promotion of – or raising awareness about - German as a minority language in Slovenia. There is a need for a certain presence of German on local radio and television, in the areas where German has been traditionally spoken, which would also help raise awareness of the traditional presence of the German language in Slovenia. There is still no model for teaching German as a regional or minority language in the Slovenian education system. German is taught

¹² See 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 14, 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2010)5, paragraph 15.

¹³ See, for example, 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 46.

¹⁴ See 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 14, 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2010)5, paragraph 14.

as a foreign language and, at an international school in Ljubljana, as a “mother tongue of children of other nationalities”. These models do not meet the requirements of the Charter for teaching regional or minority languages. The German speakers have emphasised the need for bilingual pre-school education and primary education in the areas where the language has been traditionally spoken. German can be studied at university level, however, according to the periodical report, no research on German has been funded by the Slovenian Research Agency in recent years. The representatives of the German speakers pointed out that they remain largely absent from the media coverage at local and national level. Associations of German speakers are active and involved in cross-border co-operation.

40. **Hungarian** is an official language along with Slovenian in the “ethnically mixed areas” of the municipalities of Hodoš/Hodos, Šalovci, Moravske Toplice, Dobrovnik/Dobrovnak and Lendava/Lendva. Bilingual education in Hungarian and Slovenian is provided to all pupils in the area irrespective of their first language. The Hungarian speakers are attached to this specific model of education, which is traditional in the area. However, shortcomings exist in the way it works in practice¹⁵, including with respect to the Hungarian language competence of the teachers. There seems to be a general consensus that the model needs to be improved. Moreover, there are concerns about the possible consequences of a pending decision of the Constitutional Court on the participation of pupils with Slovenian as a first language in bilingual education and on the functioning of the system.¹⁶

41. The use of Hungarian in practice before courts is not frequent; Hungarian is rarely the only language of proceedings and is generally used during bilingual proceedings. According to the information provided by the authorities, the district and local courts in Murska Sobota and the local court in Lendava/Lendva have no position for a bilingual judge. However, there is currently one judge in Lendava/Lendva who has a command of Hungarian. At the Murska Sobota District State Prosecutor’s Office, there are currently no prosecutors with a command of Hungarian, although a position is foreseen to this effect. However, there is one public employee who speaks Hungarian. Despite the favourable legal framework, Hungarian is not consistently used in administration and public services. Although knowledge of Hungarian is required for some positions and a bilingualism bonus is offered, the language skills of the civil servants are often not sufficient. This affects, in particular, the use of Hungarian in daily work and oral communication. Progress has been made in the provision of forms in Hungarian, which, however, remain mainly available online and generally only upon request at the offices of the administrative bodies. The Murska Sobota Administrative Unit can provide translation, but difficulties in ensuring the use of Hungarian, in particular, remain for such authorities situated outside the “ethnically mixed area” and which are responsible for it. Hungarian is used widely for place names. Hungarian is also used by some public services which are situated in the “ethnically mixed area”. For example in Lendava/Lendva these cover water, waste removal and sewage. Otherwise, the use of Hungarian in public services appears limited.

42. As far as media are concerned, Muravidéki Magyar Rádió (part of RTV Slovenija) broadcasts 24 hours per day in Hungarian (13.5 hours live, re-runs and music for the rest), while television programmes are broadcast for 30 minutes, four times per week (new programmes and re-runs), an insufficient amount in light of the ratification. As far as social care facilities are concerned, the Lendava/Lendva Retirement Home employs staff with at least an elementary knowledge of Hungarian and, according to its internal rules, a “functional knowledge” of Hungarian is desirable for positions occupied by staff in direct contact with residents/users of the service. However, in accordance with the ratification, authorities should *ensure* that social care facilities can receive or treat in their own language people who use a regional or minority language. It is also unclear to what extent the hospital in Murska Sobota, which provides services to the “ethnically mixed area”, but is situated outside it, ensures the possibility to use Hungarian. At the Murska Sobota regional unit of the Market Inspectorate, which also covers issues relevant for consumer protection,

¹⁵ See also the Report of the UN Special Rapporteur on minority issues after the visit to Slovenia, A/HRC/40/64/Add.1, 8 January 2019, paragraph 47.

¹⁶ Request for constitutional review of Article 48 of the Primary School Act (Official Gazette of the Republic of Slovenia, No. 81/06 - Official Consolidated Text, 102/07, 107/10, 87/11 and 63/13) and Article 11 of the Special Rights Act Italian and Hungarian national communities in the field of education (Official Gazette RS, Nos. 35/01 and 11/18), <https://www.us-rs.si/neresene-zadeve/vse-neresene-zadeve/?search=mad&x=0&y=0>

two positions require advanced knowledge of Hungarian¹⁷ and the staff can also provide information in Hungarian. However, there seems to be no written information about the rights of consumers provided in Hungarian. Safety instructions are not available in Hungarian.

43. **Italian** is an official language, along with Slovenian, in the “ethnically mixed areas” of the municipalities of Koper/Capodistria, Izola/Isola, Piran/Pirano and in the municipality of Ankaran/Ancarano.¹⁸ Italian speakers living in these municipalities, but outside the “ethnically mixed areas”, may use Italian in oral communication with the authorities. The Committee of Experts encourages the authorities to adopt a flexible approach in implementing the undertakings entered into by Slovenia to Italian. Education in Italian is available from pre-school to secondary and technical and vocational education. Italian can be studied at university level. Some difficulties remain in the provision of textbooks in Italian, in particular for technical and vocational education. As a rule, textbooks are either imported from Italy or translated from Slovenian. In both cases, the availability of financial resources plays a key role, together with a sometimes lengthy approval procedure for imported textbooks or the delays in translation. The recognition of professional qualifications as teachers for those having accomplished university studies in certain fields in Italy remains an issue of concern for the Italian speakers, as the two countries have different systems for teacher education. This issue remains relevant, since qualified teachers able to teach subjects in Italian are a basic condition for the functioning of the Italian schools and teacher training is generally organised in Slovenian in Slovenia.

44. The use of Italian in the judicial field is not frequent. According to the information provided by the authorities, there are a number of bilingual judges at the High Court, the District Court and in the Local Court in Koper/Capodistria, the Local and Labour Courts in Piran/Pirano, as well as bilingual state prosecutors and public employees at the Koper/Capodistria State Prosecutor’s Office. However, over recent years there have been few cases where Italian has been used in these courts. Italian is used in the field of administration, but shortcomings remain in practice, in particular with respect to some local branches of state authorities and public services. According to the periodical report, Italian has not been used at all in recent years by the Koper/Capodistria Special Social Care and Employment Centre. Bilingual place names, including street names, are regularly used. However, they remain mainly Italian translations of names in Slovenian introduced in the 20th century, not the traditional names in Italian.¹⁹ Although the Italian speakers are represented in municipal councils, which have the competence for naming streets, they have not found the necessary consensus to restore the original names. Currently, according to the information received from the Italian speakers, additional multilingual signs indicating the traditional names are being installed.

45. Programmes in Italian are produced by a regional centre in Koper/Capodistria of RTV Slovenija and broadcast by Radio Capodistria (24hours/day) and TV Koper-Capodistria (10 hours/day). The Italian speakers are concerned about the cuts in terms of staff (both journalists and technical staff) and funding affecting the Italian programmes of RTV Capodistria and indicated that over the years, financial cuts have disproportionately affected the Italian programmes.

46. As far as social care facilities are concerned, at the retirement homes in Izola/Isola and Koper/Capodistria, Italian is used in communication with the residents or the users of the long-distance care services, although there are no provisions in this respect in the internal rules. The hospital in Izola/Isola, however, only has a few doctors who are able to communicate in Italian and generally uses Slovenian. According to the periodical report, at the Koper/Capodistria-Postojna unit of the Market Inspectorate positions requiring knowledge of Italian are foreseen and the staff can also provide information in Italian. However, there seems to be no written information about the rights of consumers provided in Italian.

¹⁷ However, according the Annual Report of the Human Rights Ombudsman of the Republic of Slovenia for 2017, page 105, one position was not occupied in 2016 and was later abolished.

¹⁸ Ankaran/Ancarano is a municipality establish by Decision U-I-114/11-12 of 9 June 2019, of the Constitutional Court of Slovenia. It comprises a former part of the municipality of Koper/Capodistria and is as a whole “ethnically mixed area”.

¹⁹ See 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 216.

47. **Romani** is not yet taught as a separate subject in Slovenia, but a working group at the National Education Institute was set up October 2017, with the task of preparing the introduction of supplementary teaching of Romani. It is planned to start teaching Romani within a pilot project in the 2020-2021 school year. At present, Romani continues to be covered as part of the subjects *Romani culture* and *Encounters with cultures and ways of life*, compulsory elective subjects in the 7th-9th grades. However, in light of the information in the periodical report, these subjects are only taught in a low number of schools and to a low number of pupils. Several initiatives in the field of education, generally part of projects, aim at addressing the use of Romani in parallel with developing the knowledge of Slovenian, as well as the work of Roma assistants. Bilingual fairy tale books were published, the bilingual picture books (in Slovenian and two Romani varieties) were reprinted and interactive e-materials were launched during this monitoring period. Radio Slovenia broadcasts the programme in Romani *Amare Droma* (55 minutes weekly, on Mondays), while Radio Romica also broadcasts partly in Romani. Televizija Slovenija broadcasts the programme in Romani *So vakeres* (20 minutes twice per month). According to the periodical report, overall RTV Slovenija broadcasts 24 hours of TV programmes and 52 hours of radio programmes in Romani annually. During the on-the-spot visit, however, the Committee of Experts was informed that a private internet radio (Radio Anglunipe) had to close down recently due to a lack of funding. Roma representatives also expressed their concerns regarding the equal access to education. For this and other issues connected to the social situation of the Roma, the Committee of Experts refers to the latest opinion of the Advisory Committee of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and the fifth report on Slovenia of ECRI.²⁰

48. The Committee of Experts noted in the previous monitoring cycles that the **Serbian** language has a traditional presence in Bojanci, Marindol, Miliči and Paunoviči.²¹ Similar to Croatian, Serbian is regarded by Slovenia as one of the “languages of the nations of the former Yugoslav republics” and it is in this context that measures which benefit Serbian are taken. According to the periodical report, between 2013-2017 annual sums varying between approximately €54 000 and €76 000 (in 2013) were provided by the Slovenian authorities to co-finance 77 to 98 projects. These cover various cultural activities, not only dedicated to the promotion of the language and not necessarily aiming at the area where the language has been traditionally spoken. While acknowledging the importance of financial support to Serbian cultural activities in Slovenia, such support, which amounts to a few hundred euros per project in some cases, is clearly insufficient for an adequate protection and promotion of the language. Moreover, the Committee of Experts reiterates that earmarked permanent funding in order to ensure the running of minority institutions in the long run is also necessary. Serbian is only occasionally used on radio and television programmes, mainly in interviews in the framework of the programmes *Sami naši* and *NaGlas!* (see under 1.1 above). This does not amount to a sufficient broadcasting duration in Serbian and issues relevant for the Serbian speakers living in the area where the language has been the traditionally spoken are rarely addressed. There is no educational model for Serbian as a regional or minority language in the areas where this language is traditionally used. Serbian may be studied at university level, however, according to the periodical report, no research on Serbian has been funded by the Slovenian Research Agency in recent years. A Government Council for the Issues of the National Communities of the Peoples of the Former Socialist Republic of Yugoslavia is in place, however it does not appear to be an adequate framework for consultation on issues concerning Serbian as a regional or minority language.

²⁰ Fourth Opinion of the Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, ACFC/OP/IV(2017)003, ECRI Report on Slovenia (fifth monitoring cycle), CRI(2019)21.

²¹ See 4th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovenia, ECRML (2014) 5, paragraph 17, 3rd report of the Committee of Experts on Slovenia, ECRML (2010)5, paragraph 19.

Chapter 2 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and recommendations

2.1 Croatian

2.1.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Croatian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Croatian ²²	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Croatian as an expression of cultural wealth				=	
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Croatian					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Croatian				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Croatian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Croatian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Croatian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Croatian to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Croatian at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Croatian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Croatian					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Croatian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Croatian among their objectives 				=	
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Croatian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Croatian 				=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

²² In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/ \(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

2.1.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Croatian in Slovenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Slovenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.1.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia²³ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Recognise Croatian as a traditional minority language and start dialogue with the Croatian speakers with a view to implementing Part II of the Charter.**
- b. **Promote awareness of the Croatian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.**

II. Further recommendations

- c. Develop and make available, in the area where the language has been traditionally spoken, an educational model for Croatian as a minority language from pre-school to secondary education.
- d. Facilitate the broadcasting of local radio and television programmes in Croatian.
- e. Take resolute action to promote Croatian in public life, in co-operation with the speakers, including by providing adequate financial resources.
- f. Set up a mechanism to consult the relevant organisations representing the Croatian speakers on all matters pertaining to the protection and promotion of their language.

²³ RecChL(2004)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dcd6d)
 CM/RecChL(2007)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b5f38)
 CM/RecChL(2010)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805ba4c4)
 CM/RecChL(2014)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6eb6)

2.2 German

2.2.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of German

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning German ²⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of German as an expression of cultural wealth				=	
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of German					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote German				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of German, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using German • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of German at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of German to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on German at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of German		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of German					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to German among their objectives 				=	
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses German • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to German 				=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

²⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

2.2.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of German in Slovenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Slovenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.2.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia²⁵ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Recognise German as a traditional minority language and start dialogue with the German speakers with a view to implementing Part II of the Charter.**
- b. **Promote awareness of the German language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.**

II. Further recommendations

- c. Develop and make available, in the areas where the language has been traditionally spoken, an educational model for German as a minority language from pre-school to secondary education.
- d. Facilitate the broadcasting of local radio and television programmes in German.
- e. Take resolute action to promote German in public life, in co-operation with the speakers, including by providing adequate financial resources.
- f. Set up a mechanism to consult the relevant organisations representing the German speakers on all matters pertaining to the protection and promotion of their language.

²⁵ RecChL(2004)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dcd6d)
 CM/RecChL(2007)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b5f38)
 CM/RecChL(2010)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805ba4c4)
 CM/RecChL(2014)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6eb6)

2.3 Hungarian

2.3.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Hungarian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

Article	The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:					
	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Hungarian ²⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Hungarian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Hungarian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Hungarian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Hungarian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Hungarian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Hungarian at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Hungarian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Hungarian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Hungarian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Hungarian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Hungarian among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Hungarian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Hungarian 	=				
Part III of the Charter						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.a.ii	make available a substantial part of pre-school education in Hungarian	=				
8.1.b.ii	make available a substantial part of primary education in Hungarian		↘			
8.1.c.ii	make available a substantial part of secondary education in Hungarian		↘			
8.1.d.ii	make available a substantial part of technical and vocational education in Hungarian		↘			
8.1.e.iii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Hungarian or of facilities for the study of Hungarian as an university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.f.iii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Hungarian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				

²⁶ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Hungarian²⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Hungarian	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Hungarian		✓			
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Hungarian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings					✓
8.2	in territories other than those in which Hungarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Hungarian at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities²⁷						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Hungarian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.b.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Hungarian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.b.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Hungarian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.c.ii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.c.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Hungarian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Hungarian and the related use of documents and evidence in Hungarian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Hungarian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Hungarian		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Hungarian or in bilingual versions	=				
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Hungarian	=				
10.2.a	use of Hungarian within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Hungarian to submit oral or written applications in Hungarian to the regional or local authority	=				

²⁷ Slovenia has ratified "Article 9, paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d", thereby covering all the possibilities provide by the Charter under Article 9.1. In its previous monitoring cycles, the Committee of Experts assessed these undertakings from the perspective of the highest option (9.1.ai, bi, ci), with the understanding that is includes all the other options. In the new layout of the report, the Committee of Experts has decided to examine each provision.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Hungarian²⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian					= 28
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Hungarian	=				
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Hungarian in debates in their assemblies					= 29
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Hungarian in debates in their assemblies			=		
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Hungarian	=				
10.3.a	ensure that Hungarian is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.4.a	provide translation or interpretation		=			
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Hungarian		=			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Hungarian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Hungarian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Hungarian	= 30	= 31			
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Hungarian	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Hungarian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Hungarian 	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Hungarian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Hungarian	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Hungarian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Hungarian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Hungarian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Hungarian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Hungarian	=				
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Hungarian and the culture it reflects	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Hungarian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Hungarian				✓	

²⁸ This undertaking is currently not applicable.

²⁹ This undertaking is currently not applicable.

³⁰ public radio

³¹ public television

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Hungarian²⁶	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Hungarian in connection with economic or social activities	↗				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Hungarian in economic and social life					=
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Hungarian in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents or ensure the implementation of such provisions				=	
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Hungarian in economic and social life					✓
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Hungarian		=			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Hungarian				↙	
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Hungarian					✓
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Hungarian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Hungarian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Hungarian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Hungarian is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

49. It is unclear whether, in practice, a substantial part (at least 50% of the school hours taught in Hungarian per week³²) of primary, secondary and technical and vocational education is provided in Hungarian. The Committee of Experts therefore concludes that undertakings 8.1.bii, cii, d ii are only partly fulfilled. The periodical report also refers to the need to enhance and modernise training programmes, in particular with respect to the methods and contents of bilingual education. The Committee of Experts considers undertaking 8.1.h partly fulfilled. It is not clear whether monitoring in the sense of Article 8.1.i is currently in place (see under 1.1 above). The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of this undertaking. According to the information received from the authorities, there are no provisions in Slovenian legislation which expressly prohibit the insertion into internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Hungarian. The Committee of Experts therefore considers undertaking 13.1.b not fulfilled. The authorities have informed the Committee of Experts that no practices designed to discourage the use of Hungarian in connection with economic or social activities have been identified; undertaking 13.1.c is therefore considered fulfilled. It is not clear whether in the public sector, activities are organised to promote the use of Hungarian in economic

³² See 5th report of the Committee of Experts on the application of the Charter by Slovakia, CM(2019) 126, paragraph 57.

and social life. The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of undertaking 13.2.b. As safety instructions are not drawn up in Hungarian, the Committee of Experts considers undertaking 13.2.d not fulfilled. Written information concerning the rights of consumers does not seem to be made available in Hungarian therefore the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of undertaking 13.2.e.

2.3.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Hungarian in Slovenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Slovenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.3.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia³³ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Strengthen the bilingual education system, including by providing adequate teacher training for teaching in Hungarian.**
- b. **Increase the duration and frequency of broadcasting in Hungarian on public television.**

II. Further recommendations

- c. Promote awareness of the Hungarian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.
- d. Continue to take measures to ensure the use of Hungarian in local branches of state administration and in the provision of public services.
- e. Ensure that social care facilities, in particular hospitals responsible for the “ethnically mixed areas”, offer the possibility of receiving and treating people in Hungarian.

³³ RecChL(2004)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dcd6d)
CM/RecChL(2007)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b5f38)
CM/RecChL(2010)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805ba4c4)
CM/RecChL(2014)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6eb6)

2.4 Italian

2.4.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Italian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Italian ³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Italian as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Italian	=				
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Italian		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Italian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Italian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Italian at all appropriate stages	=				
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Italian to learn it	=				
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Italian at universities or equivalent institutions	=				
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Italian	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Italian	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Italian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Italian among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Italian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Italian 	=				
Part III of the Charter						
<i>(Additional undertakings chosen by the state for specific languages)</i>						
Art. 8 – Education						
8.1.ai	make available pre-school education in Italian	=				
8.1.bi	make available primary education in Italian	=				
8.1.ci	make available secondary education in Italian	=				
8.1.di	make available technical and vocational education in Italian	=				
8.1.eiii	encourage and/or allow the provision of university or other forms of higher education in Italian or of facilities for the study of Italian as a university or higher education subject	=				
8.1.fiii	favour and/or encourage the offering of Italian as a subject of adult and continuing education	=				
8.1.g	ensure the teaching of the history and the culture which is reflected by Italian	=				
8.1.h	provide the basic and further training of the teachers teaching (in) Italian	=				

³⁴ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Italian³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
8.1.i	set up a supervisory body responsible for monitoring the progress achieved in the teaching of Italian and for drawing up public periodic reports of its findings					↙
8.2	in territories other than those in which Italian is traditionally used, allow, encourage or provide teaching in or of Italian at all the appropriate stages of education	=				
Art. 9 – Judicial authorities						
9.1.ai	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the criminal proceedings in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.ii	guarantee the accused the right to use Italian in criminal proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iii	provide that requests and evidence, whether written or oral, shall not be considered inadmissible in criminal proceedings solely because they are formulated in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.a.iv	produce, on request, documents connected with criminal legal proceedings in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations involving no extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.1.bi	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the civil proceedings in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.bii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Italian in civil proceedings without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.b.iii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Italian in civil proceedings, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ci	provide that the courts, at the request of one of the parties, shall conduct the proceedings concerning administrative matters in Italian, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.cii	allow, whenever a litigant has to appear in person before a court, that he or she may use Italian in proceedings concerning administrative matters without thereby incurring additional expense, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.ciii	allow documents and evidence to be produced in Italian in proceedings concerning administrative matters, if necessary by the use of interpreters and translations	=				
9.1.d	with regard to the conduct of civil and/or administrative proceedings in Italian and the related use of documents and evidence in Italian, ensure that the use of interpreters and translations does not involve extra expense for the persons concerned	=				
9.2.a	not to deny the validity of legal documents solely because they are drafted in Italian	=				
Art. 10 – Administrative authorities and public services						
10.1.ai	ensure that local branches of the national authorities use Italian		=			
10.1.b	make available widely used national administrative texts and forms in Italian or in bilingual versions	↗				
10.1.c	allow the national authorities to draft documents in Italian	↗				
10.2.a	use of Italian within the framework of the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.b	possibility for users of Italian to submit oral or written applications in Italian to the regional or local authority	=				
10.2.c	publication by regional authorities of their official documents also in Italian					=
10.2.d	publication by local authorities of their official documents also in Italian	=				35

³⁵ This undertaking is currently not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Italian³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
10.2.e	use by regional authorities of Italian in debates in their assemblies					= 36
10.2.f	use by local authorities of Italian in debates in their assemblies	=				
10.2.g	use or adoption, if necessary in conjunction with the name in the official language, of place names in Italian		=			
10.3.a	ensure that Italian is used in the provision of public services		=			
10.4.a	provide translation or interpretation		=			
10.4.b	recruitment and training of officials and public service employees speaking Italian		=			
10.4.c	comply with requests from public service employees having a knowledge of Italian to be appointed in the territory in which that language is used		=			
10.5	allow the use or adoption of family names in Italian	=				
Art. 11 – Media						
11.1.ai	ensure the creation of at least one public radio station and one public television channel in Italian	=				
11.1.ei	encourage and/or facilitate the creation and/or maintenance of at least one weekly or daily newspaper in Italian	=				
11.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • guarantee freedom of direct reception of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Italian • do not oppose the retransmission of radio and television broadcasts from neighbouring countries in Italian • ensure the freedom of expression and free circulation of information in the written press in Italian 	=				
11.3	ensure that the interests of the users of Italian are represented or taken into account within bodies guaranteeing the freedom and pluralism of the media	=				
Art. 12 – Cultural activities and facilities						
12.1.a	encourage production, reproduction and dissemination of cultural works in Italian	=				
12.1.d	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities incorporate the knowledge and use of the Italian language and culture in the undertakings which they initiate or for which they provide backing	=				
12.1.e	ensure that the bodies organising or supporting cultural activities have at their disposal staff who have a full command of Italian	=				
12.1.f	encourage direct participation by representatives of the users of Italian in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	=				
12.2	In territories other than those in which Italian is traditionally used, allow, encourage and/or provide cultural activities and facilities using Italian					✓
12.3	make provision, in cultural policy abroad, for Italian and the culture it reflects	=				
Art. 13 – Economic and social life						
13.1.a	eliminate from the legislation any provision prohibiting or limiting without justifiable reasons the use of Italian in documents relating to economic or social life, particularly contracts of employment, and in technical documents such as instructions for the use of products or installations	=				
13.1.b	prohibit the insertion in internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Italian				↙	
13.1.c	oppose practices designed to discourage the use of Italian in connection with economic or social activities	↗				
13.1.d	facilitate and/or encourage the use of Italian in economic and social life					✓
13.2.a	include in financial and banking regulations provisions which allow the use of Italian in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents or ensure the implementation of such provisions				↙	

³⁶ This undertaking is currently not applicable.

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Italian ³⁴	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
13.2.b	in the public sector, organise activities to promote the use of Italian in economic and social life					↙
13.2.c	ensure that social care facilities such as hospitals, retirement homes and hostels offer the use of Italian		=			
13.2.d	ensure that safety instructions are also drawn up in Italian					↙
13.2.e	arrange for information provided by the authorities concerning the rights of consumers to be made available in Italian					↙
Art. 14 – Transfrontier exchanges						
14.a	apply bilateral and multilateral agreements with the States in which Italian is used in identical or similar form, or conclude such agreements, to foster contacts between the users of Italian in the States concerned in the fields of culture, education, information, vocational training and permanent education	=				
14.b	for the benefit of Italian, facilitate and/or promote co-operation across borders, in particular between regional or local authorities in whose territory Italian is used in identical or similar form	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

Changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle

50. It is not clear whether monitoring in the sense of Article 8.1.i is currently in place in Slovenia (see under 1.1 above). The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of this undertaking. Since forms in Italian are available on the official website www.e-uprava.gov.si, the Committee of Experts considers undertaking 10.1. b fulfilled. Documents such as identity cards or driving licences are issued bilingually. The Committee of Experts therefore considers undertaking 10.1.c fulfilled. According to the periodical report, cultural activities organised outside the “ethnically mixed areas” can only be financed through a general public tender. It is, however, not clear if any such activities have been funded. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude on the fulfilment of undertaking 12.2. According to the information received from the authorities, there are no provisions in Slovenian legislation which prohibit the insertion into internal regulations of companies and private documents of any clauses excluding or restricting the use of Italian. The Committee of Experts therefore considers undertaking 13.1.b not fulfilled. The authorities have informed the Committee of Experts that no practices designed to discourage the use of Italian in connection with economic or social activities have been identified; undertaking 13.1.c is therefore considered fulfilled. It is not clear how the authorities facilitate and/or encourage the use of Italian in connection with economic and social life, in the sense of Article 13.1.d. Therefore, the Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of this undertaking. According to the periodical report, the legislation does not foresee an obligation to use regional or minority languages in drawing up payment orders or other financial documents, but does not prevent it either. Nevertheless, no such documents seem to be drafted in Italian; undertaking 13.2.a is therefore considered not fulfilled. It is not clear whether in the public sector, activities are organised to promote the use of Italian in economic and social life. The Committee of Experts therefore cannot conclude on the fulfilment of undertaking 13.2.b. It is unclear whether safety instructions are drawn up in Italian. Therefore, the Committee of Experts cannot conclude

on the fulfilment of undertaking 13.2.d. The same is applicable to written information concerning the rights of consumers and undertaking 13.2.e.

2.4.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Italian in Slovenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Slovenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.4.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia³⁷ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. **Ensure sufficient resources for the provision of radio and television programmes in Italian at least at the present level.**

II. Further recommendations

- b. Promote awareness of the Italian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.
- c. Continue to take measures to ensure the use of Italian in local branches of state administration and in the provision of public services.
- d. Ensure that adequate textbooks in Italian are available for all levels of education.
- e. Ensure the use of traditional forms of place names in Italian.
- f. Ensure that social care facilities, in particular hospitals responsible for the “ethnically mixed areas”, offer the possibility of receiving and treating people in Italian.

³⁷ RecChL(2004)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dcd6d)
 CM/RecChL(2007)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b5f38)
 CM/RecChL(2010)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805ba4c4)
 CM/RecChL(2014)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6eb6)

2.5 Romani

2.5.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Romani

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Romani ³⁸	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter <i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Romani as an expression of cultural wealth	=				
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Romani					= 39
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Romani		=			
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Romani, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life		=			
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Romani • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Romani at all appropriate stages		=			
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Romani to learn it		=			
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Romani at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Romani	=				
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Romani	=				
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Romani among their objectives 		=			
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Romani • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Romani 	=				

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

³⁸ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/> (treaty No. 148).

³⁹ This undertaking is not applicable to Romani as a non-territorial language.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

In its evaluation of the application of Art. 7.1-7.4 to Romani, the Committee of Experts has kept in mind that these provisions should be applied *mutatis mutandis*.

2.5.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Romani in Slovenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Slovenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.5.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia⁴⁰ remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- | |
|--|
| a. Start teaching Romani as a subject at all appropriate levels and develop a scheme for the training of teachers able to teach Romani. |
|--|

II. Further recommendations

- b. Promote awareness of the Romani language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.

⁴⁰ RecChL(2004)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dcd6d)
CM/RecChL(2007)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b5f38)
CM/RecChL(2010)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805ba4c4)
CM/RecChL(2014)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6eb6)

2.6 Serbian

2.6.1 Compliance of Slovenia with its undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages concerning the protection and promotion of Serbian

Symbols used to mark changes in the evaluation compared to the previous monitoring cycle: ↗ improvement ↘ deterioration = no change

The Committee of Experts considers the undertaking*:						
Article	Undertakings of Slovenia concerning Serbian ⁴¹	fulfilled	partly fulfilled	formally fulfilled	not fulfilled	no conclusion
Part II of the Charter						
<i>(Undertakings which the state must apply to all regional or minority languages within its territory)</i>						
Art. 7 – Objectives and principles						
7.1.a	recognition of Serbian as an expression of cultural wealth				=	
7.1.b	ensure that existing or new administrative divisions do not constitute an obstacle to the promotion of Serbian					=
7.1.c	resolute action to promote Serbian				=	
7.1.d	facilitation and/or encouragement of the use of Serbian, in speech and writing, in public life (education, judicial authorities, administrative authorities and public services, media, cultural activities and facilities, economic and social life, transfrontier exchanges) and private life				=	
7.1.e	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintenance and development of links, in the fields covered by this Charter, between groups in the State using Serbian • establishment of cultural relations with other linguistic groups 		=			
7.1.f	provision of forms and means for the teaching and study of Serbian at all appropriate stages				=	
7.1.g	provision of facilities enabling (also adult) non-speakers of Serbian to learn it				=	
7.1.h	promotion of study and research on Serbian at universities or equivalent institutions		=			
7.1.i	promotion of transnational exchanges, in the fields covered by this Charter, for the benefit of Serbian		=			
7.2	eliminate any unjustified distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference relating to the use of Serbian					=
7.3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • promote mutual understanding between all the linguistic groups of the country • promote the inclusion of respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian among the objectives of education and training • encourage the mass media to include respect, understanding and tolerance in relation to Serbian among their objectives 				=	
7.4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • take into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by the group which uses Serbian • establish a body for the purpose of advising the authorities on all matters pertaining to Serbian 				=	

* The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages evaluates the compliance of States Parties with their undertakings under the Charter as follows:

Fulfilled: Policies, legislation and practice are in conformity with the Charter.

Partly fulfilled: Policies and legislation are wholly or partly in conformity with the Charter, but the undertaking is only partly implemented in practice.

Formally fulfilled: Policies and legislation are in conformity with the Charter, but there is no implementation in practice.

Not fulfilled: No action in policies, legislation and practice has been taken to implement the undertaking.

No conclusion: The Committee of Experts is not in a position to conclude on the fulfilment of the undertaking as no or insufficient information has been provided by the authorities.

⁴¹ In order to facilitate readability, the provisions of the Charter appear here in a shortened and simplified form. The complete version of each provision can be consulted on the website of the Treaty Office: [http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/\(treaty No. 148\)](http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/(treaty%20No.%20148)).

2.6.2 Recommendations by the Committee of Experts on how to improve the protection and promotion of Serbian in Slovenia

The Committee of Experts encourages the Slovenian authorities to comply with all undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages which are not considered “fulfilled” (see under 2.6.1 above), as well as to continue to comply with those that are fulfilled. In doing so, the authorities should take particular account of the recommendations set out below. The recommendations by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on the application of the Charter in Slovenia⁴² remain valid in their own right. Recommendations made in the monitoring procedure of the Charter aim to support the authorities in the implementation process.

I. Recommendations for immediate action

- a. Recognise Serbian as a traditional minority language and start dialogue with the Serbian speakers with a view to implementing Part II of the Charter.**
- b. Promote awareness of the Serbian language and culture as an integral part of the cultural heritage of Slovenia in mainstream education and in the media.**

II. Further recommendations

- a. Develop and make available, in the area where the language has been traditionally spoken, an educational model for Serbian as a minority language from pre-school to secondary education.
- b. Facilitate the broadcasting of local radio and television programmes in Serbian.
- c. Take resolute action to promote Serbian in public life, in co-operation with the speakers, including by providing adequate financial resources.
- d. Set up a mechanism to consult the relevant organisations representing the Serbian speakers on all matters pertaining to the protection and promotion of their language.

⁴² RecChL(2004)3 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805dcd6d)
 CM/RecChL(2007)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805b5f38)
 CM/RecChL(2010)5 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805ba4c4)
 CM/RecChL(2014)4 (https://search.coe.int/cm/Pages/result_details.aspx?ObjectId=09000016805c6eb6)

Chapter 3 [Proposals for] Recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

The Committee of Experts, while acknowledging the efforts the Slovenian authorities have undertaken to protect the regional and minority languages spoken in the country, has in its evaluation chosen to concentrate on some of the most important deficiencies in the implementation of the Charter. The recommendations forwarded by the Committee of Experts to the Committee of Ministers should not, however, be interpreted as diminishing the relevance of the other, more detailed observations contained in the report, which remain valid in their own right. The recommendations proposed by the Committee of Experts are drafted accordingly.

The Committee of Experts of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, in accordance with Article 16 (4) of the Charter, proposes on the basis of the information contained in this report, that the Committee of Ministers makes the following recommendations to Slovenia.

The Committee of Ministers,

In accordance with Article 16 of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages;

Having regard to the instrument of ratification deposited by Slovenia on 4 October 2000 and the declaration registered at the Secretariat General on 27 June 2007;

Having taken note of the evaluation made by the Committee of Experts of the Charter with respect to the application of the Charter by Slovenia;

[Having taken note of the comments submitted by the Slovenian authorities on the content of the report of the Committee of Experts;]

Bearing in mind that this evaluation is based on information submitted by Slovenia in its fifth periodical report, supplementary information provided by the Slovenian authorities, information submitted by bodies and associations legally established in Slovenia and on the information obtained by the Committee of Experts during its on-the-spot visit;

Recommends that Slovenia take account of all the observations and recommendations of the Committee of Experts and, as a matter of priority:

1. recognise Croatian, German and Serbian as minority languages traditionally spoken in Slovenia and apply the provisions of Part II to these languages, in co-operation with the speakers;
2. develop the teaching of the Romani language and culture at all appropriate levels;
3. intensify measures to raise public awareness of the regional or minority languages in mainstream education and in the mass media;
4. ensure sufficient resources for the provision of television programmes in Hungarian and Italian.

The Committee of Ministers invites the Slovenian authorities to submit the information on the implementation of the recommendations for immediate action contained in the fifth report of the Committee of Experts in due course and their sixth periodical report by 1 January 2023⁴³.

⁴³ See Committee of Ministers Decisions [CM/Del/Dec\(2018\)1330/10.4e - CM-Public](#), and Outlines for the periodical reports on the implementation of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages to be presented by the States Parties, [CM\(2019\)69 final](#).

Appendix I: Instrument of Ratification



Slovenia

Declaration contained in a Note Verbale from the Permanent Representation of Slovenia, dated 19 September 2000, handed to the Secretary General at the time of deposit of the instrument of ratification, on 4 October 2000 – Or. Fr.

In accordance with Article 7, paragraph 5, of the Charter, the Republic of Slovenia will apply *mutatis mutandis* the provisions of Article 7, paragraphs 1 to 4, also to the romani language.

Period covered: 01/01/2001 -

Articles concerned : 7

Declaration contained in a Note verbale from the Permanent Representation of Slovenia, dated 26 June 2007, registered at the Secretariat General on 27 June 2007 – Or. Engl.

The Republic of Slovenia declares that it accepts several other obligations of the Charter not already specified in a Note verbale handed to the Secretary General at the time of deposit of the instrument of ratification. At the same time the Republic of Slovenia specifies the paragraphs or sub-paragraphs chosen in accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, and Article 3, paragraph 2, of the Charter, from among the provisions of Part III of the Charter it applies in respect of each of the two languages it declared are considered as regional or minority languages in the territory of the Republic of Slovenia, respectively. In accordance with Article 3, paragraph 3, these undertakings are deemed to form an integral part of the ratification and have the same effect as from their date of notification. Within the meaning of the above-said, the Republic of Slovenia replaces the declaration contained in a Note verbale, dated 19 September 2000, with the following declaration:

"The Republic of Slovenia declares that the Italian and Hungarian languages are considered as regional or minority languages in the territory of the Republic of Slovenia within the meaning of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages. In accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2, of the Charter, the Republic of Slovenia will apply to these two languages the following provisions of the Part III of the Charter :

Article 8

For the Italian language:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), b (i), c (i), d (i), e (iii), f (iii), g, h, i

Paragraph 2

For the Hungarian language :

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (ii), b (ii), c (ii), d (ii), e (iii), f (iii), g, h, i

Paragraph 2

Article 9

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, b, c, d

Paragraph 2, sub-paragraph a

Article 10

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), b, c

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3, sub-paragraph a

Paragraph 4

Paragraph 5

Article 11

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a (i), e (i)

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3

Article 12

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1, sub-paragraphs a, d, e, f

Paragraph 2

Paragraph 3

Article 13

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph 1

Paragraph 2

Article 14

For the Italian and Hungarian languages:

Paragraph a

Paragraph b".

Period covered: 27/06/2007 -

Articles concerned : 2

Appendix II: Comments from the Slovenian authorities

The Government of the Republic of Slovenia would like to thank the Committee of Experts for its 5th Report on the implementation of the European Charter on Regional or Minority Languages (hereinafter: the Charter) by the Republic of Slovenia (hereinafter: the Fifth Report of the Committee of Experts). We appreciate the Committee's recognition of the high standards of protection enshrined in the Slovenian Constitution, as well as the progress made in a number of fields.

However, the Government would like to underline that the Fifth Report of the Committee of Experts does not adequately take into account the Declaration of the Republic of Slovenia – based on the Slovenian Constitution – submitted upon the ratification of the Charter.

The Government of the Republic of Slovenia is, nevertheless, committed to take appropriate measures with a view of further improving the situation regarding regional or minority languages in Slovenia.

In order to additionally clarify certain issues and remarks as well as recommendations made by the Committee of Experts, the Government of the Republic of Slovenia hereby submits its comments to the Fifth Report of the Committee of Experts.

Chapter 1

With regard to the application of Part II of the Charter, the Government would like to underline that upon its ratification, Slovenia has submitted the Declaration which reads as follows:

"The Republic of Slovenia declares that the Italian and Hungarian languages are considered as regional or minority languages in the territory of the Republic of Slovenia within the meaning of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages. In accordance with Article 2, paragraph 2 of the Charter, the Republic of Slovenia will apply to these languages the following provisions of the Part III of the Charter..."

"In accordance with Article 7 paragraph 5, of the Charter, the Republic of Slovenia will apply *mutatis mutandis* the provisions of Article 7, paragraphs 1 to 4, also to the Romani language."

Therefore, in the Republic of Slovenia, the Charter applies to the following languages: Italian Hungarian and Romani.

As an integral part of the law on the ratification of the Charter, the Declaration is binding for the Government. It is important to underline that none of the Contracting parties has objected to the content of the Declaration.

The content of the Declaration derives from the Slovenian Constitution, which refers to two national minorities - the Italian and Hungarian national community - and the Roma community as the constitutional minority categories.

According to the Constitution of the Republic of Slovenia, the autochthonous Italian and Hungarian national minorities have been granted special collective rights. A measure of special collective rights is also provided to the Roma community (Articles 64 and 65 of the Constitution).

Persons belonging to all other ethnic groups, including Croats, Serbs and the German-speaking ethnic group, enjoy individual rights under Articles 14, 61 and 62 of the Constitution, which guarantee to everyone equal human rights and fundamental freedoms irrespective of national origin (Article 14); the right to freely express affiliation with their nation or national community, to foster and give expression to their culture, and to use their language and script (Article 61); and the right to use their language and script in a manner provided by law in the exercise of their rights and duties and in procedures before state and other authorities performing a public function (Article 62).

The Declaration of the Republic of Slovenia on the Status of National Communities of the Former SFRY in the Republic of Slovenia was adopted in 2011 providing the basis for the establishment of the Council of

the Government of the Republic of Slovenia for the Issues of National Communities of Former SFRY Nations in the Republic of Slovenia (hereinafter: the Council). The Council acts as a consultative body of the Slovenian Government which addresses the issues, requests and proposals of the members of these national communities, and adopts positions on the proposals for decisions of the Government and ministries relating to the issues of these national communities. It serves as an institutional framework for conducting dialogue between the representatives of the Government and the representatives of these national communities.

The Republic of Slovenia also ensures the exercise of individual rights in culture to the members of the German-speaking ethnic group in Slovenia. Every year, the Ministry of Culture publishes an annual project tender for the selection of cultural projects under the programme aimed at the members of the German-speaking ethnic group which are financed by the Republic of Slovenia with budgetary funds earmarked for cultural activities on the basis of the Agreement between the Government of the Republic of Slovenia and the Government of the Republic of Austria on cooperation in culture, education and science. The objectives of the public tender are the preservation, development and promotion of linguistic and cultural diversity and cultural identity of the members of the German-speaking ethnic group in the Republic of Slovenia and a higher level of regional and sectorial cultural integration of their members.

The Slovenian education system offers many opportunities for learning German, which is the second most widely taught foreign language in Slovenian primary and secondary schools. German can be learned as the first, second or third foreign language as part of both compulsory and elective programmes. The Ministry of Education, Science and Sport also co-funds the teaching of the German language and culture as supplementary home language classes for students of foreign nationalities (cf. Table II below).

Croatian and Serbian can be learned as foreign languages within the scope of compulsory optional subjects in primary schools and as supplementary home language and culture classes for students of foreign nationalities (cf. Table II below).

Slovenia is the only country in Europe with an umbrella law on Roma who enjoy protection at the constitutional level. The Ministry of Education, Science and Sport, together with the National Education Institute, strives to introduce the Romani language as home language and culture classes for members of the Roma community, which is one of the many activities included in a wide scope of measures aimed at increasing the social and cultural capital of Roma in the Republic of Slovenia. The development of language skills includes manuals in Romani as well as materials for learning Romani and publishing of numerous picture books in Romani. The Government has funded the codification of the Romani language and the elaboration of the Romani grammar and dictionary. It encourages the compiling and publishing of the Slovenian-Romani dictionary. The Council of Europe has recognized the Slovenian multi-stakeholders project 'The increase of social and cultural capital in areas with a Roma population' as an example of good practice and published it on its website.

The Republic of Slovenia strives to raise awareness about the languages of different ethnic communities and groups as well as the mutual understanding between all linguistic groups in the country. Furthermore, it encourages the media to pursue the same objectives through public tenders. The Government finances (through national budget funds) media programmes in public interest, including those that facilitate the exercise of the right to public information for different ethnic communities and groups.

The Ministry of Culture also co-finances the programmes of Radiotelevizija Slovenija for languages of national communities and other ethnic communities and groups. In accordance with the Radiotelevizija Slovenija Act, the broadcasting of radio and television programmes of the Italian and Hungarian national communities as well as for the Roma community is defined as public service activity that Radiotelevizija Slovenija is obliged to carry out. In its programming, Radiotelevizija Slovenija must support among others, the dissemination of knowledge of other cultures represented in Slovenia and their representatives.

The Ministry of Culture co-finances cultural projects of the Italian and Hungarian national communities, Roma community, Croatian and Serbian ethnic communities as well as the German-speaking ethnic group (cf. Table I below). The objectives are to preserve, develop and promote the culture, language and identity

of the community or group, to promote high-quality cultural creativity and a higher level of protection of cultural rights and their regional and sectorial cultural integration. Awareness of the language and culture of different ethnic communities and groups is also promoted by public libraries.

These languages have been and will be included in national language policy programmes (the former covered the period 2014–2018, while a new resolution for 2020–2024 is being prepared) through measures aimed at preserving, developing and promoting the language and culture of different ethnic communities and groups within the framework of language education and infrastructure.

Chapter 3

Slovenia attaches great importance to the rights of minorities as one of the fundamental human rights provided for by its democratic political system, which lays down the conditions for their exercise. Special rights of minorities reflect a pluralistic society and lay the foundations for tolerance and understanding between people.

Slovenia has been regularly taking part in numerous activities of the international and regional fora addressing minority issues. We participate and actively engage in different bodies within the UN (as one of the main sponsors of the resolution on minority issues within the Human Rights Council) and the EU. A more balanced approach adopted by the Committee of Experts in its Fifth Report would have better reflected the overall high protection and promotion of national minorities in the Republic of Slovenia, including the promotion and protection of cultural (linguistic) rights of the members of other ethnic communities and groups.

The Government of the Republic of Slovenia is fully determined to continue with the efforts to raise and promote the tolerance towards the languages of its national minorities and other ethnic communities and groups and to address the issues where there is room for improvement, in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Slovenia and its Declaration submitted upon the ratification of the Charter.

Table I – Cultural programmes

1. The cultural programme of the Hungarian national community and activities to preserve the Hungarian language

Year	Funds granted (in EUR)
2018	420,142.27
2019	421,341.00
2018–2019	841,483.27

2. The cultural programme of the Italian national community and activities to preserve the Italian language

Year	Funds granted (in EUR)
2018	289,927.00
2019	203,795.00
2018–2019	493,722.00

3. Co-financed cultural projects of the Roma community in the Republic of Slovenia

Year	Number of co-financed cultural projects	Funds granted (in EUR)
2016	83	92,115.00
2017	75	92,115.00
2018	57	92,115.00
2019	71	92,115.00
<i>2016–2019</i>	<i>286</i>	<i>368,460.00</i>

4. Co-financed cultural projects of the German-speaking ethnic group on the basis of a public tender for the selection of cultural projects of the programme intended for the German-speaking ethnic group in the Republic of Slovenia and a public tender for co-financing cultural projects of different ethnic communities and groups published by the Public Fund for Cultural Activities of the Republic of Slovenia

- a) A public tender for co-financing cultural projects on the basis of the Agreement between the Government of the Republic of Slovenia and the Government of the Republic of Austria on cooperation in culture, education and science

Year	Number of co-financed cultural projects	Funds granted (in EUR)
2016	22	22,108.00
2017	21	22,108.00
2018	25	22,108.00
2019	18	22,108.00
<i>2016–2019</i>	<i>86</i>	<i>88.432,00</i>

- b) A public tender for co-financing cultural projects of different ethnic communities and groups published by the Public Fund for Cultural Activities of the Republic of Slovenia

Year	Number of co-financed cultural projects	Funds granted (in EUR)
2016	2	1,500.00
2017	4	2,000.00
2018	4	2,600.00
2019	2	1,150.00
<i>2016–2019</i>	<i>12</i>	<i>7.250,00</i>

5. Co-financed cultural projects of the Croatian and Serbian communities on the basis of a public tender for the selection of cultural projects of different ethnic communities and immigrants in the Republic of Slovenia published by the Public Fund for Cultural Activities of the Republic of Slovenia

a) Co-financed cultural projects of the Croatian community in the Republic of Slovenia

Year	Number of co-financed cultural projects	Funds granted (in EUR)
2016	35	25,100.00
2017	37	26,150.00
2018	32	22,800.00
2019	29	20,823.00
<i>2016–2019</i>	<i>133</i>	<i>94,873.00</i>

b) Co-financed cultural projects of the Serbian community in the Republic of Slovenia

Year	Number of co-financed cultural projects	Funds granted (in EUR)
2016	90	58,300.00
2017	75	53,771.19
2018	78	48,879.00
2019	85	57,502.00
<i>2016–2019</i>	<i>328</i>	<i>218,452.19</i>

The amount of resources allocated for the cultural program of the Hungarian and Italian national communities and the amount of resources allocated for public tenders for cultural projects of other ethnic communities and groups are determined according to the budget of the Republic of Slovenia and in accordance with the expressed cultural needs of members of the Hungarian and Italian national communities and other ethnic communities and groups.

Table II – Educational programmes

Supplementary home language classes of German, Serbian and Croatian - number of students per language per year

	German		Serbian		Croatian	
	No. of students	EUR	No. of students	EUR	No. of students	EUR
2010/11	46	2070,00				
2011/12	46	2070,00			72	
2012/13	60	2700,00	35	1575,00	72	
2013/14	59	2655,00	5	225,00	66	
2014/15	67	3.015,00	8	360,00	112	
2015/16	85	3.825,00			90	
2016/17	90	4050,00	7	315,00	90	
2017/18	90	4.050,00			76	
2018/19	75	3.375,00			79	
2019/20	74	3.330,00	4	180,00	69	

The possibility of supplementary home language classes depends on the agreements with the ethnic communities in question or the authorities of the countries of origin. Classes, generally taking place in Slovene primary schools, are co-financed by the Slovenian Ministry of Education, Science and Sport (MESS). Some ethnic communities organize their supplementary home language classes every year, some from time to time. They are encouraged by the MESS to continue their efforts in providing the home language classes regularly. The MESS co-financing was not requested by the Croatian community.